



SWORWIB QUARTERLY BOARD MEETING
Ohio Means Jobs Center
May 8, 2014 • 8:00 a.m.
Minutes

SWORWIB Members Present: Douglas Arthur, Tracy Burnett, Jack Cameron, Michael Conner, Margaret Fox, Natalie Galbato, Crystal German, April Gillespie, Sharon Hancock, Betsy Harris, Gail Holloman, Laurence Jones, Maggie Lund, Paul Magnus, Kathy Maybriar, Walter McLarty, Renè McPhedran, Dee Dee Miller, Trish Nash, Ruth Nkrumah-Martey, Gregg Oshita, Terry Phillips, Kevin Powell, Eric Rademacher, Eric Riddick, Gwen L. Robinson, Jennifer Roeder, William Rutz, Safi W. Safi, Doug Sizemore, Harry Snyder, Carol Sorenson-Williams, Mark Stoeber, Barry Strum, Tyronne Stuckey, Robin Throckmorton, Alicia Tidwell, Beverly Williams, George Wilson, Pamela Wilson, Charles Wright, Steve Yancy, Christopher Young.

SWORWIB Members Absent: Julia Abell, West Africa, Jay Alvaro, Steve Browne, Carla Chance, Chad Day, Timothy Devine, Sanserrae Frazier, Crystal German, Jennifer Graft, Shawn Harter, Gregory Johnson, Mike Kelly, Joseph Kramer, Andrew Lotter, Tim McCartney, Chris Monzel, Johnmark Oudersluys, Dan Ripberger, Amy Tanaka, Brian Thomas, Greg Toebbe, Karen Wessel, Allen Zink.

SWORWIB Staff: Sherry Kelley Marshall, Wesley Miller, Tamara Nared, Kathleen Williams

Resources: Kevin Holt, Lynn Murphy

Guests: Ben Aydin, Robert J. Haas, Becky Wilson

I. Opening – Welcome and Introductions

Having exceeded quorum, Chair Powell opened the May 8, 2014 Annual Meeting and Board Strategy at 8:03 a.m., requesting that all members and guests introduce themselves and reminding everyone to sign-in at the registration desk as attendance record keeping is required for this quasi-public & nonprofit 501c3 board. Special recognition was provided to newly elected Board members who were present: Douglas Arthur, Laurence Jones, Ruth Nkrumah-Martey, Trish Nash, Alicia Tidwell, George Wilson, Pamela Wilson, Steve Yancey, and Christopher Young. Marshall asked for a round of applause for Kevin Powell and Meridian Bioscience, Inc. for their generosity in providing our breakfast.

II. Approval of the Agenda

Chair Powell reviewed the agenda and reminded members that the consent agenda is used by larger boards to handle the business of the organization in an efficient fashion in order to have time to focus on essential discussions. The practice is that everyone reviews the entire agenda before approval including a close review of the consent agenda and then indicates during the “Approval of the Agenda” any consent agenda item they wish to move from the consent agenda to “Other Business” for separate discussion. There being no agenda corrections noted or requests for agenda changes, Magnus moved, Oshita seconded a motion that the agenda be approved as previously distributed. Motion passed unanimously.

III. Consent Agenda

There being no other corrections, additions or requests for separate discussion about items on the consent agenda, Stuckey moved, Snyder seconded a motion to approve the Consent Agenda. Motion passed unanimously. The following materials provided in the board packet were, therefore, approved:

- Policies: Limited Funds Plan and 2014 Poverty Guidelines (with a list of all SWORWIB policies affected by the new guidelines)
- President’s Report
- 2014-2016 Business Plan
- FY 2014 Consolidated Budget Revision
- FY 2015 Consolidated Budget
- 1916 Central Parkway Budget 2015

- HCJFS Scope of Services Draft
- Emerging Workforce Development Council Report
- Measurement and Continuous Improvement Committee Report
- Required Partners Leadership Council Report
- OhioMeansJobs Center Report
- Administrative Entity/Fiscal Agent Report
- Media/Public Relations Report

IV. Chairman's Report & Executive Evaluation Process

Chair Powell expressed appreciation to all the board members who dedicated so many hours to the Board Survey, the Annual Meeting and Bi-Annual Strategy Session. He also thanked the Board Officers for their service between quarterly meetings and the Committee Chairs, Co-Chairs, and Team Leaders for their service. Powell reviewed the Executive Compensation Policy and Procedures for Executive Evaluation. He noted that he would send an email to all Board members requesting feedback on President Marshall's performance and needed members to provide him their thoughts and any concerns or suggestions by the end of the month so her review could be conducted in June and all documentation completed by the end of the organization's fiscal year and programmatic year.

V. Nominating Committee Report

Powell introduced Natalie Galbato and thanked her for her leadership with the Nominating Committee and working tirelessly with President Marshall for new board members and onboarding activities. Galbato reported that the nominating activities are underway now. Those whose terms expire at December 2014 will be contacted by Marshall to discuss continuation or completion of their term so we can confirm the number of openings on the board. Those whose attendance has not been adequate will be contacted to determine their ongoing interest in board service. Letters to economic development agencies, public officials, union directors, and chambers of commerce will be issued within the month requesting business representation nominations. Galbato directed everyone's attention to Page 106 of the Board Packet and encouraged them to nominate one or two or more candidates and send the forms to President Marshall. She also shared that two officers will be completing their terms and exiting the board, so business board members who are interested in service as a board vice-chair need to discuss their interest with her soon.

VI. President's Report

Questions on President's Written Report

Marshall asked if there were any questions on her written report and there being none, she took a moment to thank April Gillespie for agreeing to host a workshop on LinkedIn for staff interested in social networking and how to teach jobseekers to use the LinkedIn Network. Marshall thanked her for not doing the workshop at the same time as the meeting and hoped she would be able to attend when it is rescheduled for a later date.

Farewell to Kathleen Williams

Marshall announced that Kathleen Williams has taken a position in Clermont County and would be leaving the SWORWIB after the Memorial Day weekend. Marshall led a round of applause for Kathleen and provided a farewell card and gift from the SWORWIB. Marshall reported that she is exploring options for the youth coordinator and public information coordinator roles, including having a summer intern for key tasks, while opening(s) are being broadly posted.

Grant and Audit Update

Marshall reported that federal and state grant opportunities seem to cluster a couple of times a year, and this time of year is very busy for new grant activity. There are four ReadyToWork Grants for long term unemployed jobseekers; renewal of Youth Builds grants, grants for adjudicated youth to get to work, grants for urban re-entry services to former offenders, and more TAACCCT grants for community colleges to train people for in-demand industries. There is also a state grant release that used the incentive dollars earned by the best of the performing WIBs in Ohio but is now being redirected to a competitive grant for Workforce Alliances – as in industry sectors for career pathways. Grants notices for apprenticeship programs are also expected by the end of the summer.

Relative to the Audit Update, there are no audits due until October, but more monitoring site visits and reviews are expected for late summer. Relative to the Department of Labor Comprehensive Monitoring Site Visits in February and March, the report to the State of Ohio is expected to be completed this summer as well and will need to be responded to in partnership with ODJFS. Marshall reported that the monitoring site visit was quite challenging this

time and she had expressed concerns about 1) the amount of time the SWORWIB had to pay Pat Massey to load hundreds of documents to a central drop box which was not used by the nearly dozen team members and instead many staff spent hours copying what had already been sent electronically. Additionally, there were last minute requests by the youth monitor to set up meetings with EDWC members, youth providers, and WIA youth and then changes were made each day taking more time for one group and less time for the in-school group for whom a class schedule of activities was altered for the monitor's convenience and then not used. The monitoring also had no time boundaries as governance decisions from 2004 relative to the Inter-Governmental Services Agreement between the City and County to combine into one WIB were being questioned a decade later. Monitors were not prepared and did not obtain all that they needed or use what was drop-boxed, so Marshall and others are still responding to requests for information and then a week later, more information about what was sent previously. It has been much more draining than any monitoring site visit in the last seven years from Marshall's experience, but hopefully we are answering the last round of new and follow-up questions and will have a written report by the end of the summer.

Office Options

Marshall noted that many on the board may have already seen news coverage of the impending consolidation of many agencies from the Chamber to the Cincinnati Business Committee to the Port Authority and the JobsOhio Regional Economic Development Initiative into a single office location at 3 East Fourth Street. She reported that there are four affiliate organizations that are considering moving with the Chamber: SCOMSDC, Japanese American Society, Partners for A Competitive Workforce and the SWORWIB. Space is in the very back of the first floor for all of the affiliates. The space is a 6x6 cubicle each, a single 3-drawer filing cabinet for each agency and two small drawers under the desk cubes. Currently the SWORWIB has 12 3-drawer filing cabinets to hold files which are required to be maintained for a period of 7 years minimum – and we just got a monitoring that went back 10 years. Additionally, the space will no longer be free. There was discussion about the history of SWORWIB association with the Chamber of Commerce and the availability of paymaster and benefits from affiliation with the Chamber, but concern about Marshall and the staff having such small space and such limited storage. Stuckey questioned what other options there are for the SWORWIB. Marshall reported having started on researching options such as space in the lower level at the OMJ Center which should be available by June 2015. Another option is to move directly to space at the OMJ Center on the second floor, and then move to vacated basement area in June 2015. Marshall asks if anyone has or knows of any available space to contact her as an office move is going to have to be achieved by October at the latest. Chad Day shared that he may have some available space in tri-county. Marshall will pursue other options and provide a summary of all options for the August Board Meeting.

DOL Waivers Proposal

Marshall reported that the recent meetings in Washington, DC and local meetings with staff of Boehner, Brown and Portman's offices had been very supportive of some of the SWORWIB's "crusades" from prior years. In conversation with DOL Secretary Tom Perez and Eric M. Seleznow, Deputy Assistant Secretary of DOL's Employment and Training Administration, Perez and Seleznow had encouraged Marshall to convert these "crusades" into requests for waivers from existing WIA law for experimental or pilot project explorations. The State of Ohio supports several of the waiver requests and staff are working with Marshall to forward these formally to the Department of Labor. Additionally, Marshall is working with staff in the Boehner, Brown and Portman offices on two proposals, Brown's SECTORS Act and Portman's CAREERS Act, both of which are being advanced as part of the plans to reauthorize WIA but include these approaches. An update on our proposals will be provided at the August meeting. The request for a three-year pilot program for youth credentials. The waivers will not affect the federal guideline numbers. Employers are willing to accept the NCRC Assessments versus the GED scores. The DOL is expected to accept the pilot program. We will use the waivers to experiment with what we know already works.

National Science Foundation & WIB's Opportunity Youth Training

Marshall reported private foundations are now becoming interested in doing research and projects in association with the workforce system. Today she will be leaving immediately after the board meeting for a conference sponsored by the National Science Foundation relative to decades of efforts to improve STEMM college enrollment by disadvantaged, minority and women students. NSF is seeking assistance from workforce boards in key urban cities to improve connections for enrollment and employment through the WIA services to youth. Marshall has been meeting with UC STEMM leadership and expects ongoing efforts to build partnership between the STEMM programs and WIB youth activities. Marshall also reported on new grant funding she had obtained through Partners for A Competitive Workforce from the Annie E. Casey Foundation (AEC), a national leader for informatics on kids and education. AEC is now partnering to experiment with workforce boards to move "opportunity youth" into credential programs, apprenticeship programs and other employment options that also provide them postsecondary

credentials and credit. As Kathleen Williams moves to her new position, Marshall and the summer intern will arrange for a pre-apprenticeship training program to be completed, healthcare entry level credentials and Information Technology credentialed training for graduating seniors and out-of-one-year Jobs for Cincinnati Graduates as well as youth from Lighthouse and out-of-school youth from Literacy Center West. Once the results of this pilot are available for AEC review, there may be new opportunities to work with AEC on further development of "opportunity youth" for credentialed training and employment.

MSSC June Events Hosted in Cincinnati

Marshall reviewed the information on the June events with the Manufacturing Skills Standards Council that the SWORWIB is hosting here in Cincinnati, at the GE Learning Centre and in Sharonville. The SWORWIB won the bid to host the MSSC Annual Meeting back in September and has been working on these events for the last nine months. Marshall referred board members to the materials included in the Board Packet. She reviewed the June 18, 2014 MSSC Executive Briefing, "MSSC in the TriState," which will more closely examine the MSSC credential and its impact on building a highly skilled workforce pipeline in our region and the tri-state of Ohio, Kentucky and Indiana featuring employers from all states, college presidents from all three states, and workforce board executives from all three states. Other events include a briefing by Brig. Gen. John O'Neil IV, Commandant, U.S. Army Quartermaster School, on logistics credentialing for veterans, and a Hiring Our Heroes Veterans Job Fair June 19, 2014 being held at the Sharonville Convention Center. Members were asked to please pass this information along to others in their organizations who are interested in veteran hiring.

Outline of OMJ Operator Agreement

Marshall reported that the DOL monitors went back 10 years in their review and questioned the formation of the SWORWIB in 2004, the role of City Mayor as the Chief Elected Official and the roles of the County which they saw as conflicted. Marshall had argued that when HCJFS was selected as the one stop operator, the SWORWIB had acted responsibly in approving annual performance goals and reviewing progress quarterly and in obtaining an independent monitor to conduct site visits and file reviews since HCJFS could not be expected to monitor themselves under WIA. In the course of governance discussions, monitors felt this was not adequate and a specific memorandum of agreement or understanding between the SWORWIB and HCJFS as the one-stop operator is required. Although we are awaiting a written monitoring report, Marshall and Holt determined it would be good to move forward on this discussion point. The Outline of an OMJ Operator Agreement between the SWORWIB and HCJFS was provided in the Board Packet to obtain SWORWIB board member feedback and approval of undertaking this direction whether it is included in the final monitoring report or not. Stoeber asked if this was an example for items to be discussed and recommended for the next meeting or if this document is what is proposed. Marshall responded that it is an outline and she will redraft it for the next meeting, but wanted to have a motion on record by the Board that the SWORWIB is working on a one-stop operator agreement. Stuckey complimented Marshall on taking a proactive stance relative to the monitor's observations on decisions made over a decade ago. Stuckey moved, Snyder seconded a motion encouraging this outline to be edited by Marshall and Holt into a one-stop operator agreement that the Board could review and approve for the August meeting. There being no additional comments or questions, the motion passed unanimously.

OMJ Performance Goals 2015

Marshall referred board members to Page 133 in the Board Packet where the Service Priorities and Measures for our OMJ Center are being proposed for July 1, 2014 through June 30, 2015. As mentioned earlier, this is one of the activities the SWORWIB does relative to performance oversight of the one-stop operator. Powell asked Holt to review the current performance in comparison to these new priorities and measures and any other suggestions he has for the Board's consideration. Holt noted that we are working with 26% less money and a loss of 15-20 staff at the one-stop. HCJFS has been focused on results and pushing for better results. Holt stated that he would like to do more than chase increasing number. He proposed that there needs to be an increase in average wages, proposing as much as a goal of \$13/hour for those who receive training dollars in particular. Right now the average wage is \$11/hour so it is reasonable to increase this goal to \$12/hour, thereby not focusing on minimum-wage jobs but rather on in-demand occupations that meet or exceed new performance measures from the Governor's office. Powell asked for details on hourly wages based on which kinds of services. Holt obtained this data from staff and shared local data for period the period of July 13, 2013-February 2014: \$10.43/hour with no prior training; \$11.22/hour with no on-the-job training; \$15.20 with on-the-job training; \$16.46 with ITA training. Stoeber indicated that this information showed stunning results and complimented the team for getting these kinds of results with less funding and fewer staff. Marshall proposed that perhaps the eligible training provider and ITA policies should be updated for average wages of \$12 an hour instead of \$9. Maybriar suggested looking at the rapid response program for measures and make efforts to enhance performance of the dislocated worker program in Hamilton

County which doesn't have as much dislocated worker success as other urban areas are achieving. Holt noted that HCJFS does better with adults versus dislocated workers. He sees a lot more paperwork needed for the dislocated worker so it's often easier to service dislocated workers as adults. Marshall commented that she, Holt and Maybriar have looked at this situation previously and there does seem to be requirements for dislocated worker identification that seem burdensome particularly when we know that there are layoffs at an employer, but that knowledge is inadequate without the dislocation memo and a last pay stub, for examples. Maybriar has volunteered to assist with staff training to improve dislocated worker results for Area #13. Stuckey complimented Holt for the metrics that are showing such positive results. Holt noted the employment goal is on track to double or triple by the end of this year. Fox asked if metrics could be provided by zip code so the Board could view the community-wide impact of services or whether there are communities that are not receiving benefits of the OMJ Center. Holt noted that hosting hiring events, not job fairs, but where interviews are done on the spot has really improved results. Marshall reports that she has undertaken a request for proposals for transition services with the Honeywell dislocation in order to serve the employer and dislocated workers in a timely fashion before they exit the worksite permanently. The SWORWIB can issue an RFP quickly and get back proposals to be evaluated quickly and the contract quickly with the selected vendor. Marshall applied for a couple hundred thousand in additional funds to serve the Honeywell dislocated workers and was granted these funds in short order and promised additional funds if the plant closing is delayed and services can be provided to assist more workers through the extended time frame. Simultaneously, HCJFS is going through its bidding and contracting processes while this dislocation is being served under the SWORWIB's contract, so they will be prepared with pre-approved vendors for any future dislocations. Stuckey asked about using the State contracting system through purchase orders for which Marshall noted that this system is uniquely related to construction related services. Stoeber moved, Magnus seconded a motion to change the hourly wage rate for training provider performance standards to \$12 an hour up from \$9. Motion passed unanimously. Stuckey moved, Fox seconded a motion to approve the One-Stop Performance Measures for the next program year and encourage HCJFS to continue to stretch to achieve more. Motion passed unanimously.

HCJFS as Required Partner

Marshall referred members to Page 134, the last page in the Board Packet that explained the history of Job and Family Service Departments on and off the WIB boards and in and out of one-stop partnering. HB 1 reinstated the JFS departments in each county as a required partner in the local workforce system and as such returned the requirement that the county JFS department be represented on the local workforce board. Timothy McCartney who previously served on the Board is now back on the board as the HCJFS/TANF representative.

Other

Central Parkway Bike Trail: Marshall reported on the progress of the Central Parkway Bike Trail and our results in getting some safety concessions from the City and Metro. She noted that there had been considerable controversy about the Bike Trail, but it should be operational by the end of the summer.

Cincinnati Works, the Freestore and Urban League: Marshall reported that State leadership in the Office of Workforce Transformation had been visiting other nonprofit agencies doing workforce development and had been approached by lobbyists to provide funds to these nonprofits for their workforce programs. Marshall and Holt are working to see what system connection improvements can be made, but have been clear that becoming a service provider under WIA requires a bidding procedure and contracting with performance measures. Marshall will continue to engage these agencies and work with them on grant proposals until the SWORWIB issues any new requests for proposals after current contracts are reaching their endpoints.

VII. Presentation: Census Bureau Findings on America's Credentialed Labor Force

At Powell's request, Marshall introduced board member Eric Rademacher who is Co-Director of the University of Cincinnati's Institute for Policy Research. Marshall and Rademacher had been discussing the U.S. Census Bureau's failure to add industry credentials as an option for citizens in responding about their educational achievements. Rademacher learned about some new research by the U.S. Census Bureau on Measuring Alternative Educational Credentials so Marshall asked for a presentation to the board. Rademacher noted the strengths and weaknesses of the research but expressed appreciation that the topic is at least on the Census Bureau radar and this first attempt at the federal level to measure postsecondary educational credentials – not just degrees – is a step forward and likely to be an undercounting. Dr. Rademacher distributed a handout on the PowerPoint slides and presented these highlights to the board. Members were very interested in the implications of this kind of research and findings. Miller raised questions about how to qualify "professional certificates". Conner

noted that the hospitality industry requires a variety of credentials about food safety, cooking safety and other necessary training confirmations but he doubts that workers would think to mention these in a census survey if not prompted in some way but he agrees that there are industry recognized credentials in many businesses that are not factored into federal reporting since the focus has always been on high school graduation and college degrees. Dr. Rademacher closed with the hope that additional research is undertaken, and that employers are brought into the Census Bureau research to speak to their use of industry recognized credentials that may not have any connection to college credit but are valued as necessary in their industries. He also noted that Marshall has been a leader in the region and beyond advocating for inclusion of credentials and not just college credit in the summary of the American workforce work readiness status.

VIII. Presentation: Historical Trends with Credentials funded from Individual Training Accounts

Powell welcomed Robert Haas from the Ohio Department of Job and Family Services who is one of the information and data specialists for the State. Haas explained that training is one of the primary activities in the Workforce Investment Act (WIA) and Individual Training Accounts (ITAs) are how training is paid for in WIA. He reviewed five years of the impact of completers of training, focusing on what type of training, what credentials, percent of employment after training, percent retaining their jobs and first year wages. Haas reported that healthcare and truck driving have been the top two industry training categories for the five year period. Occupational skills licenses and certificates far outweigh the number of associate and bachelor degrees. Employment has averaged 80%, retention has been steady at 85-90% and wages have averaged between \$30-35,000. He remarked that the recession definitely affected both training and wages for 2008-2010. Powell asked if our local experience mirrored the statewide results Haas reported. Marshall confirmed that healthcare and CDL licenses have been top uses of ITAs in our area. Holt obtained information from Lynn Murphy on just Area #13's activities of the last two years which were similar, but sometimes better for wages and retention. German asked about the issues with degrees to which Haas indicated that certificates have industry value, take less time to obtain and cost less; therefore people who need to work for a living seek out the shorter term credentials that allow them to obtain employment. Marshall also replied that the expense of college is a burden for most American's and the SWORWIB could not justify giving a single individual the \$20,000-\$50,000 for a year or two in college given the standard funding of WIA, let alone during the recession and with the 15- 26% annual cuts of the last two years. Fox spoke to the importance of public schools in better preparing graduates for work and college. Stuckey noted that colleges have not redesigned themselves to deliver concentrated instruction that is needed by adults who need to get back to work as soon as possible and can't take a class for a couple of hours a week for 20 weeks – they need 6-8 hours for lots fewer weeks and then into employment. Powell thanked Haas for his presentation of this trend data and his drive to Cincinnati to share the data with the Board. He also thanked Holt for obtaining the local comparison data and requested that Holt include some of these details in his August end of the year report to the Board

IV. Public Comments & Other Business

Powell asks if there are any comments for the public at this time. Becky Wilson, Career Coach at MAX Technical Training asked if either Haas or Rademacher had seen any research regarding the employer point of view on credentials over college credit, noting that there seems to be a lot of information from the government and educational bodies about the value of credentialing, but she would like to see research from the employer point of view. Both speakers confirmed that the employer point of view was not reflected in the data they presented, but employer board members had expressed themselves during the presentations about how they use credentials and many people who obtain skill credentials from manufacturing to information technology to healthcare are able to obtain employment and succeed in their positions so there is an implied value in credentials from these successes.

Powell asks if there is any other business to come before the Board. There being no one else making comment, Marshall again recognizes Kathleen Williams on her service with the SWORWIB and congratulates her on her new job. Marshall requests that any member knowing of any possible candidates for this open position email her and she will forward the job description. Williams accepts the accolades and applause from the Board and recounts her experiences as a dislocated worker from the newspaper business and thanks Marshall for seeing her skills and hiring her for the Public Information Coordinator for one year during ARRA funding and then rehiring her later for the youth and public information combined position. She thanked Marshall for her openness to dislocated workers and her coaching and support to become a Public Relations Society of America certified professional. Sizemore thanked Williams for reminding us all of the challenges of the last years with the downturn in the economy and Obama's efforts to turn the economy around.

X. Next Meeting Reminders

Powell reviewed the upcoming meetings for the summer and some decisions not to hold some meetings due to the staff transitions and Marshall's vacation plans.

- **June 12, 2014** – Executive Committee Meeting 8:00 a.m.
- **July 2014** – No Executive Committee Meeting, EWDC Meeting, MCI Committee Meeting
- **August 14, 2014** – Quarterly Board Meeting

IX. Adjournment

There being no further business, McPhedran moved, Fox seconded a motion to adjourn at 10:00 a.m. Motion passed unanimously.

Respectfully submitted,



René McPhedran
Secretary